

SCRIPTA CLASSICA ISRAELICA

YEARBOOK OF THE ISRAEL SOCIETY
FOR THE PROMOTION OF CLASSICAL STUDIES

VOLUME XLII

2023

ISSN 0334-4509 (PRINT)
2731-2933 (ONLINE)

The appearance of this volume has been made possible by the support of

Bar-Ilan University
Ben-Gurion University of the Negev
The Hebrew University of Jerusalem
The Open University
Tel Aviv University
University of Haifa

PUBLISHED BY
THE ISRAEL SOCIETY FOR THE PROMOTION OF CLASSICAL STUDIES
<http://www.israel-classics.org>

Manuscripts in the form of e-mail attachments should be sent to the e-mail address rachelze@tauex.tau.ac.il. For reviews, contact yulia@bgu.ac.il. Please visit our website for submission guidelines. All submissions are refereed by outside readers.

Books for review should be sent to the Book Review Editor at the following address: Book Review Editor, Prof. Yulia Ustinova, Department of General History, Ben-Gurion University of the Negev, P.O.B. 653 Beer Sheva 8410501, Israel.

Price \$50

© 2023 The Israel Society for the Promotion of Classical Studies
All Rights Reserved

Camera-ready copy produced by the editorial staff of *Scripta Classica Israelica*
Printed in Israel by Magnes Press, Jerusalem

SCRIPTA CLASSICA ISRAELICA

YEARBOOK OF THE ISRAEL SOCIETY
FOR THE
PROMOTION OF CLASSICAL STUDIES

Editor-in-Chief: RACHEL ZELNICK-ABRAMOVITZ

Editorial Board:
AVI AVIDOV
ALEXANDER YAKOBSON
YULIA USTINOVA

Editorial Assistant: Hila Brokman

INTERNATIONAL ADVISORY BOARD
OF *SCRIPTA CLASSICA ISRAELICA*

François de Callataÿ, Brussels and Paris
Hubert Cancik, Tübingen
Averil Cameron, Oxford
Hannah M. Cotton, Jerusalem
Ephraim David, Haifa
Werner Eck, Köln
Denis Feeney, Princeton
Margalit Finkelberg, Tel Aviv
John Glucker, Tel Aviv
Erich Gruen, Berkeley
Benjamin Isaac, Tel Aviv

Ranon Katzoff, Ramat Gan
David Konstan, New York
Jaap Mansfeld, Utrecht
Doron Mendels, Jerusalem
Ra'anana Meridor, Jerusalem
Maren Niehoff, Jerusalem
John North, London
Hannah Rosén, Jerusalem
Brent Shaw, Princeton
Greg Woolf, Berkeley

THE ISRAEL SOCIETY FOR THE PROMOTION
OF CLASSICAL STUDIES

OFFICERS 2022–2023

President:	Jonathan Price
Secretary:	Sylvie Honigman
Treasurer:	Shimon Epstein

COMMITTEE MEMBERS

Moshe Blidstein
Daniella Dueck
Andrea Rotstein
Iris Sulimani
Yulia Ustinova

HONORARY MEMBERS OF THE SOCIETY

Hannah Cotton
Joseph Geiger
Ranon Katzoff
Ra'anana Meridor

CONTENTS

	PAGE
PREFACE TO VOLUME XLII	1
ORY AMITAY, Classics in Israel: Where Do We Go From Here?	3
AMIT BARATZ, Greece and Rome in Israeli Schools	9
ANDREA BALBO, ELISA DELLA CALCE, AND SIMONE MOLLEA, Towards an Unusual <i>speculum principis</i> ? Virtues in the <i>Confucius Sinarum Philosophus' Proemialis Declaratio</i>	19
WERNER ECK, Hadrian in Iudaea. Zu gefälschten Inschriften υπέρ σωτηρίας αὐτοκράτορος Καίσαρος Τραιανοῦ Ἀδριανοῦ	41
ESTHER ESHEL, HAGGAI MISGAV, AND ROI PORAT, Legal Ostraca From Herodium	53
ALEXANDROS KAMPAKOGLU, Daphnis in the Middle: Theocritus' Inter-generic Poetics and the Origins of the Bucolic Genre	67
YOSEF Z. (YOSSIE) LIEBERSOHN, Δίκαιος and Cognates in Plato's Crito	91
DMITRY EZROHI, When Teleology Fails: Aristotle on Bile as a Useless Residue in <i>Parts of Animals</i>	111
ERRATA	131
 BOOK REVIEWS	
Franco Montanari, <i>History of Ancient Greek Literature. Volume 1: The Archaic and Classical Ages</i> , with the collaboration of Fausto Montana, translated from the Italian original by Rachel Barritt Costa with revision by Orla Mulholland; <i>Volume 2: The Hellenistic Age and the Roman Imperial Period</i> , with the collaboration of Fausto Montana, translated from the Italian original by Orla Mulholland (by Heinz- Günther Nesselrath)	133
Sitta von Reden (ed.), <i>The Cambridge Companion to the Ancient Greek Economy</i> (by Jeremy Trevett)	137
Jennifer Baird and April Pudsey (eds.), <i>Housing in the Ancient Mediterranean World: Material and Textual Approaches</i> (by Michael Eisenberg)	139
Julia L. Shear, <i>Serving Athena: The Festival of the Panathenaia and the Construction of Athenian Identities</i> (by Ilaria Bultrighini)	142
David Saunders (ed.), <i>Underworld: Imagining the Afterlife in Ancient South Italian Vase Painting</i> (by Rivka Gersht)	144
Michaël Girardin, <i>L'offrande et le tribut. Histoire politique de la fiscalité en Judée hellénistique et romaine (200 a.C.–135 p.C.)</i> (by Benedikt Eckhardt)	147
Noah Hacham and Tal Ilan (eds.), <i>Corpus Papyrorum Judaicarum V: The Early- Roman Period (30 BCE–117 CE)</i> (by Haggai Olshanetsky)	149
Michael Philip Penn, Scott Fitzgerald Johnson, Christine Shepardson, and Charles M. Stang (eds.), <i>Invitation to Syriac Christianity: An Anthology</i> (by Catalin-Stefan Popa)	152
 OBITUARIES: DAVID WEISSERT (by RACHEL ZELNICK-ABRAMOVITZ)	157
MOSHE FISCHER (by OREN TAL AND ITAMAR TAXEL)	161
AMINADAV A. DYKMAN (by ABRAHAM AROUETTY)	164
 DISSERTATIONS IN PROGRESS	167
PROCEEDINGS: THE ISRAEL SOCIETY FOR THE PROMOTION OF CLASSICAL STUDIES	175

shifted to the ideal role of an individual who fought for Athens and served both the goddess and the city. S. concludes that the relationship of Athenians to Rome was not reflected in the festival.

Chapter 7 looks at the ways in which other residents and non-residents constructed identities by participating in the Great Panathenaia. According to S., Athenian women and girls, metics and their daughters, colonies, allies and, after 229 BCE, other cities created identities that focused on their service to the goddess (yet, the assistance provided by metics' daughters to the *kanephoroi* is regarded as service to the city). In contrast, the identities of Athenian boys, beardless youths, ephebes, and foreign benefactors concentrated on their relationship to the polis, and only indirectly on serving Athena. S. relegates to a brief mention in a footnote the fact that metic women, metic boys and slaves were excluded from participation in the festival. Within the community of "all the Athenians", differences in rank and visibility were evident and (of course) depended on the citizenship, social and economic status of its various members. Despite its international dimension, the Panathenaia were an Athenian festival, and as such, never joined the four great games of the cycle (the Olympia, the Pythia, the Nemea, and the Isthmia), which were Panhellenic festivals. Conversely, S. claims that the Panathenaia were never part of the cycle due to their focus on constructing identities and on demonstrating what it meant to be a member of "all the Athenians".

In the final chapter (Ch. 8) S. presents some closing remarks. She illustrates similarities and differences between the Little and the Great Panathenaia; since the differences pertained to participation and inclusivity, they affected the politics of identity at the festival. While the annual occasion was a local and inclusive event, the penteteric festivities had an international and exclusive character. The chapter also includes a comparison between the Panathenaia and a few other Athenian festivals, which leads S. to the conclusion that the former stood out as the most inclusive and international celebration in Athens.

This book is a very valuable and significant contribution to our knowledge of the Panathenaia at Athens, the city's most important festival in honour of Athena. Through a comprehensive analysis of a variety of primary sources, S. provides the first diachronic investigation of the history and development of the Panathenaia at Athens, with an emphasis on the changes the festival underwent over its nearly 1,000 years of existence. These are (in the reviewer's opinion) the greatest merits of the present monograph. While one could lament the continuous repetitions and question the author's decision to shift her focus to processes of identity creation, S.'s book remains a major piece of scholarship which will certainly serve as a reference work for a long time.

Ilaria Bultrighini

University College London
i.bultrighini@ucl.ac.uk

David Saunders (ed.), *Underworld: Imagining the Afterlife in Ancient South Italian Vase Painting*. J. Paul Getty Museum, Los Angeles, Getty Publications 2021. 244 pp. ISBN 9781606067345

This handsome volume is the outcome of a research following an exhibition titled *Underworld: Imagining the Afterlife* held in the Paul Getty Museum between October 2018 and March 2019. The Underworld imagery on the forty-two South Italian vases—mostly kraters—in the catalogue (by David Saunders, pp. 114–217) provided the catalyst for the five essays which form the first part of the book (pp. 11–112). Each essay deals with different aspect linked, directly or indirectly, with the Underworld. Together they provide contextual data needed for a better understanding of the vases' imagery and the afterlife beliefs of those who owned them, but also make clear that a full comprehension of the nature of the afterlife may never be achieved.

The first two essays by Sarah Iles Johnston (*Ancient Greek Tales of the Afterlife*, pp. 11–27) and Roy D. Kotansky (*Dialogues of the Dead on the “Orphic” Gold Tablets*, pp. 29–45) deal with textual evidence referring to the afterlife. Starting with the two Nekyiai of the *Odyssey*, Johnson provides an overview of Hades’ atmosphere, of its dwellers, of those trapped between the realms of life and death, of those condemned to eternal punishment (such as Tantalos, Sisyphus and the Danaids), and of those allowed to enter and leave (such as Dionysos, Herakles, Theseus and Orpheus). Additional early sources—the Minyas epics, the poet Bacchylides and the Homeric Hymn to Demeter—tell (respectively) about Charon, Theseus and Peirithoos (who traveled to the Underworld to ask Hades to relinquish Persephone, so that Peirithoos could marry her himself), about Herakles’ journey to capture Kerberos (the guard dog of the kingdom of Hades), and about the narrative of Persephone’s disappearance and the circumstances of the establishment of the Eleusinian mystery cult in honor of Demeter.

The Eleusinian mysteries promised their initiates ‘a sunny place within the gloom of Hades’, and the younger mysteries of the god Dionysos/Bacchus also promised ‘plenty of wine to drink’ (p. 20); but unlike the initiates of the Eleusinian mysteries, who made their way to the better part of the Underworld and were allowed to enter with no further demand, those initiated into the mysteries of Dionysos had to memorize the pass-phrases needed for entering. These instructions—discoursed at length by Kotansky (pp. 29–45)—are attributed to the legendary poet Orpheus, who also composed the less familiar version of the birth of Dionysos from the union of Persephone and Zeus. Johnston’s essay ends with a note on the correspondence between the texts and the vases’ imagery (pp. 23–26), which is the core of Saunders’ essay (pp. 91–112).

Whereas Johnston’s essay is a summary of a wide range of sources and tales, the texts discussed by Kotansky (pp. 29–45) derive from one source: The “Orphic” gold tablets of which some were found in South Italy and Sicily. The essay focuses on the dialogic nature of the instructions for the Underworld, showing how misunderstanding of grammar and syntax in previous publications led to inaccurate translations, hence to misinterpretation of the texts. Although the “Orphic” instructions are only obliquely related to and hardly reflected in the vases’ imagery, the new reading of the Getty tablet—successfully offered by Kotansky—and its implication for the reading of other tablets, make the eschatological view of the afterlife, which was prevalent in South Italy during the fourth century BC, more comprehensible.

The two following essays by Keely Elizabeth Heuer (*Sacred Sites of Apulia*, pp. 47–69) and by Andrea Celestino Montanaro (*Apulian Funerary Practices*, pp. 71–89) present an overview of the cultic and funerary practices of the Italic groups inhabiting Apulia, based on archaeological, literary and epigraphic evidence. Heuer’s essay is interesting and well written, but is of minor importance for the study of fourth century BC South Italian vase paintings. The sixth to third century BC votive gifts for the gods (pp. 51–55) for example, as the author herself notes, are not grave goods, and the identity of the deities venerated in the sacred sites of Apulia—including some of the indigenous ones, whose names are revealed in inscriptions—are not always clear. In only a few instances it is possible to point to a plausible link between finds and deities associated with the Underworld. One is the sanctuary at Timmari (in the territory of Peucetia) where ‘the objects discovered in zone A show clear affinities with the Greek worship of Demeter and Persephone’ (p. 57). Other instances are two Messapian cave sanctuaries, where archaeological, faunal (young piglets) and vegetal (as pomegranates and poppy seeds) evidence point to rites similar to those performed for Demeter and Persephone by the Greeks (p. 61–62).

As interesting as Heuer’s essay might be to the reader, in my mind a great deal of the information included in the text is inessential for the discussion in a book titled *Imagining the Afterlife in Ancient*

South Italian Vase Painting; especially in light of the essay by Montanaro (pp. 71–89), who explores the character of the Apulian funerary customs and the ways in which elite identity is expressed through the vases imagery and the funerary goods (as armor, jewelry and bronze vases) uncovered in fifth and fourth centuries BC tombs.

These assemblages not only manifest the wealth and social role of the deceased, but also their fondness of Etruscan and Greek products, which led to the adoption of Greek cultural or ideological models corresponding with their own faith and hope for the afterlife. The essay focuses on funerary structures (*grotticella*, *semicamera*, and chamber types) in Peucetian and Daunian sites, where the deceased were buried in coffins, which were often plastered or painted inside, and in cist tombs. They were laid—contingent on the site and burial date—either on their sides or on their back with legs drawn up or bent aside and with the arms folded on the chest, or with one arm resting on the pelvis.

In Daunian burials also partial cremation was practiced; the deceased was placed next to a large pile of wood, inside the open chamber of the tomb, and only after the body was partially consumed by the pyre, the assemblage of funerary goods was brought in (p. 82). Interesting, although fairly rare, are the painted and the bas-relief figural scenes decorating the walls of the tombs (photographs, in spite of the state of preservation of the paintings, would have been helpful); they include images of Kerberos, Hermes *psychopompos*, a warrior leading a horse, and depictions of the journey of the deceased to the Underworld (perhaps inspired by Etruscan art; see Saunders p. 103). These imageries, the Greek pottery, the armor and weapons (comparable to those worn by warriors in the Underworld scene; see Saunders p. 97 and Cats 24–27), the jewelry and bronze and glass vases; all present a prosperous society, whose aristocratic warrior-chiefs and princesses had commercial and cultural contact with Greece, Etruria and Magna Graecia.

After studying the four essays and before turning to the fifth by David Saunders it is recommended to go back to the introduction (pp. 1–9) where Saunders succinctly summarizes the four essays while pointing to the deficiency in facts and to the vagueness of those available, which withhold a full comprehension of the afterlife beliefs prevalent in fourth century BC Southern Italy.

In the preview of his essay (*Imagining the Afterlife in South Italian Vase Painting*, pp. 91–112) — which constitutes an introduction to the catalogue that follows — Saunders references studies published after Pena's 1977 monograph on representations of the Underworld in Apulian pottery. He then explains the logic behind the identification of the forty-two vases in the catalogue as Underworld scenes: Persephone and/or Hades are the focus of the composition, surrounded by a variety of figures; in three vases the Danaids carrying water vessels are shown instead of the gods of the Underworld (Cats 4, 21, 42). The reasons for omitting certain scenes from the catalogue are likewise explained.

The rest of the essay deals with the vases' iconography—stressing the unique compositional style of the South Italian scenes—in comparison to parallel depictions from Greece and Etruria—and with the South Italians' attitudes toward the hereafter. Mythical figures, shown individually or in groups, their encounter with the rulers of the Underworld, their recurrence and correspondence with textual accounts, and the acquaintance of the upper-class members of the South Italian society with the Eleusinian, Dionysiac and “Orphic–Bacchic” beliefs, are all cautiously discoursed.

In the catalogue, a brief description of the vases imagery is accompanied by illuminating commentaries. As all vases have been previously discussed in scholarly studies the information is based on these publications; first and foremost on the catalogues of Trendall and Cambidoglou (1978–1982, 1983, 1991–1992) and on relevant entries in the *Lexicon Iconographicum Mythologiae Classicae* (LIMC). In a way the catalogue sum-up nearly two hundred years of scholarship, yet the

up-to-date archaeological and epigraphic studies (especially those of Montanaro and Kotansky) along with Saunders' iconographic analysis point to what else can be learned—or more exactly assumed—on the attitudes of certain fourth century BC South Italians toward the afterlife in the kingdom of Hades.

All in all, this is a highly informative volume, with ample references to primary and secondary sources, and with excellent illustrations. Its importance lies in the collection of imageries and the complementary evidence used for their interpretation; and although not completely innovative, the book may definitely be attractive to all students—those already familiar with South Italian Underworld depictions and afterlife beliefs, and those being acquainted with the subject for the first time.

Rivka Gersht

Tel Aviv University
gersht@tauex.tau.ac.il

Michaël Girardin, *L'offrande et le tribut. Histoire politique de la fiscalité en Judée hellénistique et romaine (200 a.C.–135 p.C.)*, Bordeaux: Ausonius, 2022, ISBN : 978-2356134356, 540 p., 30€

When the inhabitants of Judea were subjected to the Roman census for the first time in 6 CE, Judas the Galilean famously spearheaded a resistance movement that categorically rejected any payments, fiscal or tributary, to any ruler other than god. The impact of this 'fourth philosophy', as Josephus calls it, on later events has often been deemed significant; at the same time it has frequently been pointed out that Judas was himself working within an existing tradition that privileged offerings to god over all other forms of taxation. The purpose of Girardin's weighty book, derived from his doctoral thesis of 2017, is to comprehensively discuss the emergence of this ideology and to assess its importance for Jewish resistance to foreign powers from the Maccabees to Bar Kokhba.

The project is ambitious and wide-ranging, given that—as G. frequently notes—taxation, tribute and offerings to the temple are all embedded within wider societal discourses, making it hard to define the exact contours of the topic. G. does a very good job here by dedicating the first three chapters of his book to definitions and methodological preliminaries. He is undoubtedly correct to insist, based on modern sociology of taxation, that the underlying reason for many so-called tax revolts was not the level of taxation as such, but changes in the perception of an authority: an illegitimate government raises illegitimate taxes, no matter how high they are (pp. 29–30). Throughout the book, G. maintains this crucial distinction and thus avoids falling into the trap of positing rising levels of taxation or tribute wherever discontent with such payments is expressed in the sources. As for what constitutes taxation or tribute, his definition of "fiscalité", developed in dialogue with economic scholarship, is intentionally broad to cover the many forms and modalities of taxation in antiquity (payments in kind and in money, irregular payments, lease of royal territories etc.). G. justly notes that the manifold offerings to the temple as stipulated in biblical literature can easily be understood as a fiscal system in its own right, but are terminologically distinct from payments to political authorities: a conceptual dichotomy between what is owed to god and what is owed to men is thus written into the system of offerings that sustains priesthood and temple, but there is no conflict between them, as both are seen as distinct but legitimate expenses (pp. 67–115). The remainder of the book traces the radicalisation of this dichotomy and its development into a political slogan.