

SCRIPTA CLASSICA ISRAELICA

YEARBOOK OF THE ISRAEL SOCIETY
FOR THE PROMOTION OF CLASSICAL STUDIES

VOLUME XLII

2023

ISSN 0334-4509 (PRINT)
2731-2933 (ONLINE)

The appearance of this volume has been made possible by the support of

Bar-Ilan University
Ben-Gurion University of the Negev
The Hebrew University of Jerusalem
The Open University
Tel Aviv University
University of Haifa

PUBLISHED BY
THE ISRAEL SOCIETY FOR THE PROMOTION OF CLASSICAL STUDIES
<http://www.israel-classics.org>

Manuscripts in the form of e-mail attachments should be sent to the e-mail address rachelze@tauex.tau.ac.il. For reviews, contact yulia@bgu.ac.il. Please visit our website for submission guidelines. All submissions are refereed by outside readers.

Books for review should be sent to the Book Review Editor at the following address: Book Review Editor, Prof. Yulia Ustinova, Department of General History, Ben-Gurion University of the Negev, P.O.B. 653 Beer Sheva 8410501, Israel.

Price \$50

© 2023 The Israel Society for the Promotion of Classical Studies
All Rights Reserved

Camera-ready copy produced by the editorial staff of *Scripta Classica Israelica*
Printed in Israel by Magnes Press, Jerusalem

SCRIPTA CLASSICA ISRAELICA

YEARBOOK OF THE ISRAEL SOCIETY
FOR THE
PROMOTION OF CLASSICAL STUDIES

Editor-in-Chief: RACHEL ZELNICK-ABRAMOVITZ

Editorial Board:
AVI AVIDOV
ALEXANDER YAKOBSON
YULIA USTINOVA

Editorial Assistant: Hila Brokman

INTERNATIONAL ADVISORY BOARD
OF *SCRIPTA CLASSICA ISRAELICA*

François de Callatay, Brussels and Paris
Hubert Cancik, Tübingen
Averil Cameron, Oxford
Hannah M. Cotton, Jerusalem
Ephraim David, Haifa
Werner Eck, Köln
Denis Feeney, Princeton
Margalit Finkelberg, Tel Aviv
John Glucker, Tel Aviv
Erich Gruen, Berkeley
Benjamin Isaac, Tel Aviv

Ranon Katzoff, Ramat Gan
David Konstan, New York
Jaap Mansfeld, Utrecht
Doron Mendels, Jerusalem
Ra'anana Meridor, Jerusalem
Maren Niehoff, Jerusalem
John North, London
Hannah Rosén, Jerusalem
Brent Shaw, Princeton
Greg Woolf, Berkeley

THE ISRAEL SOCIETY FOR THE PROMOTION
OF CLASSICAL STUDIES

OFFICERS 2022–2023

President:	Jonathan Price
Secretary:	Sylvie Honigman
Treasurer:	Shimon Epstein

COMMITTEE MEMBERS

Moshe Blidstein
Daniella Dueck
Andrea Rotstein
Iris Sulimani
Yulia Ustinova

HONORARY MEMBERS OF THE SOCIETY

Hannah Cotton
Joseph Geiger
Ranon Katzoff
Ra'anana Meridor

CONTENTS

	PAGE
PREFACE TO VOLUME XLII	1
ORY AMITAY, Classics in Israel: Where Do We Go From Here?	3
AMIT BARATZ, Greece and Rome in Israeli Schools	9
ANDREA BALBO, ELISA DELLA CALCE, AND SIMONE MOLLEA, Towards an Unusual <i>speculum principis?</i> Virtues in the <i>Confucius Sinarum Philosophus' Proemialis Declaratio</i>	19
WERNER ECK, Hadrian in Iudaea. Zu gefälschten Inschriften υπέρ σωτηρίας αὐτοκράτορος Καίσαρος Τραιανοῦ Ἀδριανοῦ	41
ESTHER ESHEL, HAGGAI MISGAV, AND ROI PORAT, Legal Ostraca From Herodium	53
ALEXANDROS KAMPAKOGLU, Daphnis in the Middle: Theocritus' Inter-generic Poetics and the Origins of the Bucolic Genre	67
YOSEF Z. (YOSSIE) LIEBERSOHN, Δίκαιος and Cognates in Plato's Crito	91
DMITRY EZROHI, When Teleology Fails: Aristotle on Bile as a Useless Residue in <i>Parts of Animals</i>	111
ERRATA	131
 BOOK REVIEWS	
Franco Montanari, <i>History of Ancient Greek Literature. Volume 1: The Archaic and Classical Ages</i> , with the collaboration of Fausto Montana, translated from the Italian original by Rachel Barritt Costa with revision by Orla Mulholland; <i>Volume 2: The Hellenistic Age and the Roman Imperial Period</i> , with the collaboration of Fausto Montana, translated from the Italian original by Orla Mulholland (by Heinz- Günther Nesselrath)	133
Sitta von Reden (ed.), <i>The Cambridge Companion to the Ancient Greek Economy</i> (by Jeremy Trevett)	137
Jennifer Baird and April Pudsey (eds.), <i>Housing in the Ancient Mediterranean World: Material and Textual Approaches</i> (by Michael Eisenberg)	139
Julia L. Shear, <i>Serving Athena: The Festival of the Panathenaia and the Construction of Athenian Identities</i> (by Ilaria Bultrighini)	142
David Saunders (ed.), <i>Underworld: Imagining the Afterlife in Ancient South Italian Vase Painting</i> (by Rivka Gersht)	144
Michaël Girardin, <i>L'offrande et le tribut. Histoire politique de la fiscalité en Judée hellénistique et romaine (200 a.C.–135 p.C.)</i> (by Benedikt Eckhardt)	147
Noah Hacham and Tal Ilan (eds.), <i>Corpus Papyrorum Judaicarum V: The Early- Roman Period (30 BCE–117 CE)</i> (by Haggai Olshanetsky)	149
Michael Philip Penn, Scott Fitzgerald Johnson, Christine Shepardson, and Charles M. Stang (eds.), <i>Invitation to Syriac Christianity: An Anthology</i> (by Catalin-Stefan Popa)	152
OBITUARIES: DAVID WEISSERT (by RACHEL ZELNICK-ABRAMOVITZ)	157
MOSHE FISCHER (by OREN TAL AND ITAMAR TAXEL)	161
AMINADAV A. DYKMAN (by ABRAHAM AROUETTY)	164
DISSERTATIONS IN PROGRESS	167
PROCEEDINGS: THE ISRAEL SOCIETY FOR THE PROMOTION OF CLASSICAL STUDIES	175

up-to-date archaeological and epigraphic studies (especially those of Montanaro and Kotansky) along with Saunders' iconographic analysis point to what else can be learned—or more exactly assumed—on the attitudes of certain fourth century BC South Italians toward the afterlife in the kingdom of Hades.

All in all, this is a highly informative volume, with ample references to primary and secondary sources, and with excellent illustrations. Its importance lies in the collection of imageries and the complementary evidence used for their interpretation; and although not completely innovative, the book may definitely be attractive to all students—those already familiar with South Italian Underworld depictions and afterlife beliefs, and those being acquainted with the subject for the first time.

Rivka Gersht

Tel Aviv University
gersht@tauex.tau.ac.il

Michaël Girardin, *L'offrande et le tribut. Histoire politique de la fiscalité en Judée hellénistique et romaine (200 a.C.–135 p.C.)*, Bordeaux: Ausonius, 2022, ISBN : 978-2356134356, 540 p., 30€

When the inhabitants of Judea were subjected to the Roman census for the first time in 6 CE, Judas the Galilean famously spearheaded a resistance movement that categorically rejected any payments, fiscal or tributary, to any ruler other than god. The impact of this 'fourth philosophy', as Josephus calls it, on later events has often been deemed significant; at the same time it has frequently been pointed out that Judas was himself working within an existing tradition that privileged offerings to god over all other forms of taxation. The purpose of Girardin's weighty book, derived from his doctoral thesis of 2017, is to comprehensively discuss the emergence of this ideology and to assess its importance for Jewish resistance to foreign powers from the Maccabees to Bar Kokhba.

The project is ambitious and wide-ranging, given that—as G. frequently notes—taxation, tribute and offerings to the temple are all embedded within wider societal discourses, making it hard to define the exact contours of the topic. G. does a very good job here by dedicating the first three chapters of his book to definitions and methodological preliminaries. He is undoubtedly correct to insist, based on modern sociology of taxation, that the underlying reason for many so-called tax revolts was not the level of taxation as such, but changes in the perception of an authority: an illegitimate government raises illegitimate taxes, no matter how high they are (pp. 29–30). Throughout the book, G. maintains this crucial distinction and thus avoids falling into the trap of positing rising levels of taxation or tribute wherever discontent with such payments is expressed in the sources. As for what constitutes taxation or tribute, his definition of "fiscalité", developed in dialogue with economic scholarship, is intentionally broad to cover the many forms and modalities of taxation in antiquity (payments in kind and in money, irregular payments, lease of royal territories etc.). G. justly notes that the manifold offerings to the temple as stipulated in biblical literature can easily be understood as a fiscal system in its own right, but are terminologically distinct from payments to political authorities: a conceptual dichotomy between what is owed to god and what is owed to men is thus written into the system of offerings that sustains priesthood and temple, but there is no conflict between them, as both are seen as distinct but legitimate expenses (pp. 67–115). The remainder of the book traces the radicalisation of this dichotomy and its development into a political slogan.

Chapter four on the Seleucid period naturally pivots towards the Maccabean revolt and its explanation. Taxes have played an important role in recent discussions,¹ and G. agrees that they mattered: as others before him, he connects the Olympiodorus dossier from Maresha (178 BCE) with the Heliodorus affair of 2 Maccabees to postulate a great reform that made Seleucid taxation more efficient and more visible than before (pp. 165–68). The evidence for this remains slim, and hardly bears out the postulate that the supposed reform of 178 was more important than the Seleucid victory at Panium (confidently stated in the conclusion, p. 475). However, G.'s approach has the advantage of not having to prove a rise in taxes under Seleucus IV, and of putting the attested rise under Antiochus IV in context: for G., it was the loss of legitimacy of the Seleucid kings that made taxation problematic, not the actual (possibly still quite modest) sum. While this remains plausible, his conclusion that the Maccabean revolt was fought on a platform that, for the first time, instrumentalised the dichotomy between 'tribut et offrande' is rather weak: G. deduces it from Mattathias' speech in 1 Macc. 2 (pp. 182–84), but while it is true that it seeks to defend the sanctuary (and thus "l'offrande"), it does not mention tribute or taxes, just an opposition to this particular king. Here and in the next chapter on the emerging Hasmonean state, G. seems to rely on the assumption that the fight for "l'offrande" automatically implies an anti-fiscal agenda (which is why the Hasmoneans need to disguise their own fiscality as "offrande", p. 200): the fight for independence may indeed have created constellations where this was the case, but conceptually, there remains some unease as the argument can easily be seen as circular.

Moving on to the Roman period, the long chapter dedicated to the period between Pompey and Herod the Great (pp. 227–88) contains diligent discussion of the relevant evidence, but mostly familiar argumentation: G. usually finds himself in agreement with Udoh's comprehensive treatment of the period.² For Herod in particular, G.'s approach to dissociate complaints about taxation from the realities of taxation pays off: there is no evidence for higher taxes under Herod; it is his fraught relationship with his subjects that makes his taxes oppressive, not the other way around (pp. 276–79). With regard to the old question whether Herod paid tribute to the Romans or not, G. opts for a mixed approach: there was no regular tribute apart from the brief period when he had to pay Cleopatra, but the expected gifts to his Romans overlords can be seen as a form of tribute, disguised as friendship (pp. 254–59). It is this successful "dissimulation" that in G.'s view made the introduction of direct Roman rule all the more difficult to comprehend, triggering discontent that was then given a fiscal spin by Judas the Galilean (p. 302). G. insists that Judas revived the Maccabean heritage but radicalised the opposition between 'offrande et tribut' to the point that no worldly rule was conceivable. G. certainly finds "Maccabean heritage" in many a place: Herod exploits 'la dialectique anti-tributaire maccabéenne' when he has Nicolaus of Damascus complain to Agrippa about cities in Asia Minor taxing Jews (p. 277); Agrippa I adopts Maccabean strategies when he ostentatiously displays reverence to the temple and hence 'l'offrande' (p. 337); emerging groups like the early Christians continue the Maccabean tradition of redistributing voluntary offerings (p. 380). Not all of these connections seem viable to this reviewer, and when G. devotes a chapter to 'minority groups' and their fiscality that unites such disparate phenomena as the Qumran community, the early Christians and Galilee in the 60s (a minority group?), one wonders whether a more cautious use of analogies would have been preferable.

¹ Notably since S. Honigman, *Tales of High Priests and Taxes: The Books of the Maccabees and the Judean Rebellion against Antiochos IV* (Oakland 2014).

² F.E. Udoh, *To Caesar What Is Caesars: Tribute, Taxes, and Imperial Administration in Early Roman Palestine* (Providence, RI, 2005).

For the great revolts of 66–70 and 132–35, the discursive evidence on the role of tribute and taxation is rather slim. G. concludes that tribute was not the reason for these conflicts but a useful slogan for those who sparked them for other reasons and could then exploit the old dichotomy of “offrande et tribut”. For Bar Kokhba in particular, G. has little to go on. The short chapter (pp. 447–66) nevertheless offers thorough discussion and a punchy conclusion: when Bar Kokhba kept Roman taxes in place to finance his own short-lived realm, he did away with the opposition between “offrande et tribut” that had haunted Jewish politics since the Maccabean revolt: the tribute had become a legitimate form of taxation, although the sums remained the same, proving once again that everything depends on political legitimacy. It is a satisfying end to G.’s fiscal history, so satisfying in fact that one may easily forget how little evidence there actually is to support it.

This is an intelligent and well-researched book. G. is careful throughout to stress the limits of the evidence. While his nuanced discussions will be appreciated by any scholar, they can occasionally cause frustration—e.g. when G. dedicates multiple pages to a question only to conclude that it cannot be answered, or when several cornerstones of his fiscal narrative are labelled ‘quelque peu douteuse’ in quick succession (p. 231 on the toparchies of Gabinius, p. 233 on Crassus pillaging the temple), leaving the reader unclear about the status of G.’s historical reconstructions: are they mere “what ifs”, or serious propositions as to what happened? On several occasions, important statements are made only to be immediately nuanced to the point of downright revoking them. To give just one example, G.’s competent summary of debates around the *fiscus Iudaicus* ends with another punchy dichotomy: while in 70, an offering to god (the didrachm tax) had been transformed into tribute to Rome, Nerva’s (supposed) reform made the tax voluntary and thus a matter of religious belonging: in this case, ‘c’est le tribut qui devient une offrande’ (p. 437). The conclusion is elegant and to the point—and yet in the same paragraph, the reader is reminded that 1.) as the interpretation of Nerva’s reform is debated, the reconstruction is based on a ‘what if’ (‘si ...’); 2.) Paul could already equate “offrande et tribut” in *Romans* 13:6, well before the Jewish tax (although the argument there appears rather different); and 3.) it is unclear if this was indeed the understanding of anyone who actually had to pay the tax. It is certainly prudent to point these things out, and yet as a result, it remains unclear if G. wants to make the historical case that the tribute came to be seen as an offering to god, or if he merely wants to consider the theoretical possibility that this argument *might* be made. A reader ploughing through a book of 500 densely printed pages within the context of modern academia might well expect its author to cut some of this short and commit to a hypothesis.

On occasions such as these, the origins of the book as a doctoral thesis shine through, but they can in no way detract from the fact that this is a remarkably thorough and elegantly structured study that will remain essential reading in the field for some time to come.

Benedikt Eckhardt

University of Edinburgh
b.eckhardt@ed.ac.uk

Noah Hacham and Tal Ilan (eds.). *Corpus Papyrorum Judaicarum V: The Early-Roman Period (30 BCE–117 CE)*. Berlin: De Gruyter, 2022. XXVII+216 pp., ISBN: 9783110785999

Corpus Papyrorum Judaicarum (CPJ), devised by Victor Tcherikover, was a milestone in the research of ancient Judaism. In the three original volumes, which were published in 1957–1961, Tcherikover (and the editors of Volume III which was published after Tcherikover passed away) gathered all the papyri and ostraca that were deemed as connected to Jews and Judaism from the