

mountaintop but to all the inhabitants of the territory. GIS technology enables this to be plotted on a map, but of course does not resolve the core questions. Was fire or smoke at the heart of the ritual? Did it take place in daytime, or at night? Did the participants simply come as chosen delegates from the villages and regions, or in large numbers? And what was the religious object of the cult?

Tønnes Bekker-Nielsen himself and Jesper Madsen confine themselves respectively to documentary and literary evidence to look at historical issues. Strabo describes the city of Neapolis in the Phazimonitis region, east of the river Halys as part of Pontus, whereas Ptolemy assigned the city, in its later guise of Andrappa-Neoclaudiopolis, to Paphlagonia. Bekker-Nielsen's article 'To be or not to be Paphlagonian?' (pp. 63-74), prefers Strabo, but has to deal with the problem that Neoclaudiopolis' later inscriptions used the same era as a group of cities that lay west of the Halys in Paphlagonia. This still creates a strong *prima facie* case for believing that at the time when the era began, in 6/5 BC, all these cities then belonged to the same administrative unity (in this case the former 'Paphlagonian' kingdom of Deiotarus II Philadelphus), whatever earlier or later territorial labels were attached to this space. Madsen's paper, 'An insider's view. Strabo of Amaseia on Pompey's Pontic cities' (pp. 75-86), takes Strabo's use of the term *polis* to be relatively value-free, without substantial implications as to whether a community in a region such as Pontus was heavily hellenized or not. Accordingly Madsen distinguishes between Strabo's accounts of the coastal cities of Pontus, which explicitly drew attention to their Greekness, and those of the Pompeian foundations of the interior, which lacked the heritage on which such Greekness rested.

Only one paper looks beyond the classical period to Byzantine Pontus. Burcu Erciyas, 'A middle Byzantine citadel at Komana' (pp. 215-225), reports on excavations which reveal extensive but unpretentious remains of the eleventh century, relating to occupation, manufacture, storage and consumption of goods, but only indirectly to the wider ethnic, religious or cultural characteristics of the inhabitants of the region when it was on a contested frontier between Christians and Turks. This is one of the rare excavations in the entire region. Gradually the results of such pioneering field work will need to be integrated into Bryer and Winfield, *The Byzantine Monuments and Topography of Pontus* (1985), and other major work on the region of the medieval period. The book ends with a collective bibliography and extensive indices, which are useful to the reader, but, like Bekker-Nielsen's thoughtful introduction, do not completely disguise the heterogeneity of the contents.

Stephen Mitchell

University of Exeter

Nicola Cusumano, Valentino Gasparini, Attilio Mastrocinque, Jörg Rüpke (eds.), *Memory and Religious Experience in the Greco-Roman World. Potsdamer Altertumswissenschaftliche Beiträge*, 45. Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag, 2013. 223 pp. ISBN 9783515104258.

This volume collects selected papers delivered in two panels organized during the 9th EASR (European Association for the Study of Religions) Conference and IAHR (International Association for the History of Religions) Special Conference organized by Giulia Sfameni Gasparro at the University of Messina in 2009. The two panels, organized by Nicola Cusumano on the one hand, and Attilio Mastrocinque together with Jörg Rüpke on the other, dealt with 'Memory and Religion in the Greek World' and 'Religious Experience in Sanctuaries in the Roman World' respectively. Joined together, we now have *Memory and Religious Experience in the Greco-Roman World*, even if no paper deals with topics of both memory and experience, and only a fair few concern overtly both Greek and Roman world (Gian Franco Chiai being the notable exception). Papers delivered in other panels of this (gargantuan) event, we learn from Sfameni Gasparro's interesting report (pp. 11-14), were subject of further publications – those who wish to trace down destinies of papers delivered in other panels may wish to cross-check the

programme of the conference (<http://ww2.unime.it/easr09/eng/index.html>) against Gasparro's pages (Giovanni Casadio's interesting panel on Raffaele Petazzoni has been published, for instance, in a special issue of *SMSR*, 76/1, 2011).

The book is neatly split into two sections of five papers each, and both are introduced succinctly by the panel organisers who laid down theoretical and intellectual frameworks for investigations of 'Memory and Religion in the Greek World' (part I, pp. 15-132) and of the 'Religious Experience in the Roman World' (part II, pp. 135-212). In the general introduction (pp. 7-10), Cusumano, Mastrocinque and Rüpke, joined by Valentino Gasparini, justify the volume as intending to test the(ir) definition of religion as a cultural product by emphasising the emotional and cognitive aspects of 'memory' and 'experience'. Memory and experience, so the editors, open 'a window onto the interaction of individual and society, individual processes of memorialization and remembrance, as well as the collective evocation of memories and their shaping of individual memory.'

And so they do: this is an ambitious and wide-ranging volume which repeatedly attempts to challenge common (?) terminological inferences and axiomatic cultural assumptions without being unnecessarily polemic or ostentatiously revolutionary. Repeatedly, however, does not mean consistently: it has long since become a common place for a reviewer to state that edited volumes in general, and volumes resulting from large conferences in particular, tend to include contributions of uneven quality, and this cliché will not be left unuttered here either: Substantial and well researched contributions such as Daniela Bonnano's comparison of Messenian sacred texts with traditions of biblical Israel, Cusumano's discursive but elaborate treatment of oath, memory and oblivion in Herodotus, or Motta's investigation of divine *soteriai* in Zosimus, to mention here just the three, stand next to Isabelle Solima's rather sketchy and fragmented outline on 'Perpetuation of Memory in the Myths and Cults of Artemis in the Peloponnese'. For this reason, and reasons of space, I refrain from accounting all contributions equally, but provide outlines of some of the papers, while pointing to others in passing.

In the first part of the volume, Cusumano's introduction revisits Assmann and Bourdieu to remind us of the forces which govern social and, per proxy, religious memoryscapes – mental spaces inhabiting the landscapes of time – to claim, along with Assmann that 'in the area of the sacred, the *dromena* and the *legomena* provide a grammar and a reference system of temporal precepts and places of memory.'

The introduction sets the tone for the first paper of the volume, Cusumano's own dense contribution ('Glaucus and the Importance of being Earnest. Herodotus 6.86 on Memory and Trust, Oath and Pain'). Cusumano builds on the theoretical underpinnings from his introduction and seeks (p. 21) 'to show that the whole system of stories to which I will refer is grounded on constant and determining presence of an oath, at the crossroads of power and fragility'. After a series of inspired, predominantly structuralist, readings of Herodotean passages, esp. 6.52-85 (but he covers lots of ground also outside Herodotus), Cusumano argues that Herodotus' narrative strategies in general and the narrative function of the Glaucus episode in particular, are the historian's tools for creation of a new paradigm of memory and his (pp. 48-49) 'methods of making meaning'. In many passages Cusumano's paper reminded this reviewer of the methodological approach we saw in Emily Baragwanath's *Motivation and Narrative in Herodotus* (OUP 2008) which is missing from an otherwise extensive bibliography.

Solima's contribution, whose title I mention above, investigates Peloponnesian cults of Artemis and how they (p. 55) 'present themselves as vehicle of memory'. The paper focuses on cults of Artemis in Patrai, Megalopolis and Messene (Triklaria, Soteira, Orthia), with Pausanias as the author's principal source (noticeable is the absence of V. Pirenne-Delforge's *Retour à la source: Pausanias et la religion grecque*, 2008).

Pausanias receives a great deal of attention in Daniela Bonanno's juxtaposition of the recovery ('rediscovery') of the Book of Law (Kings 22-23) with the tale of the Messenian sacred texts famously buried by Aristomenes in a hydria on Mt. Ithome at the end of the second Messenian

War. Bonanno aims to ‘illustrate how the one may serve as a ‘comparable’ of the other within the framework of a general reflection on the uses and management of memory and on the need for representational identity’ (p. 65). Like Cusumano, Bonanno’s contribution is seminally influenced by Assman’s notion of cultural memory, and, per proxy, by Halbwachs. This sophisticated and well-informed essay makes many interesting observations concerning the ‘territorialisation’ of memory to demonstrate how tales of recovery of the texts (and hence of the memory lost) serve as vehicles for communal regeneration and, simultaneously, as tools of alteration, ‘resistance to a nearby ‘other’ (p. 77)’.

Gian Franco Chiaï turns to epigraphic record to investigate ‘local historical-religious memories in the Hellenistic and Roman world,’ aiming to ‘reconstruct the practise [*sic*] of the epigraphical publication of religious memories as well as to show its contexts and mechanisms by analyzing selected inscriptions’ (p. 82). Inspired by H.-J. Gehrke’s well-known concept of ‘intentional history’ and strongly influenced by A. Chanotis’ work (the latter is represented with 22 items in the author’s extensive bibliography), Chiaï looks at the sacred history of Magnesia on the Maeander, the aretology of Artemis and Apollo from Lycia (TAM 2.174), selected inscriptions from Xanthos, Argos, Panamara, Lebena, Lindos, Epidauros, and many other geographical locations: one text flies past after the other, and seemingly random observations on all sorts of issues abound, from comments on letter-forms and puzzling grammatical and dialectal features to remarks on socio-cultural issues. In the two main sections, Chiaï first looks at the inscriptions from the cities, and then, at inscriptions from the temples; I am not entirely sure what might be the reason for this distinction. At any rate, the author justifies his structure by stating (pp. 82-83) that there are ‘public documents’ which are ‘exposed in the public spaces of the polis and accessible to all,’ i.e. citizens and foreign visitors alike, and then, ‘documents of religious institutions, placed within sanctuaries, in which sacred memory of the temple was conserved and divulged.’ If Chiaï believed that sacred histories set up in sacred precincts somehow collectively tell a markedly different story from those set up on, say, perimeter walls of an agora, or that they operate, by way of some generalization, with a differently defined framework of reception, he has not elaborated this beyond the claim that the cities use inscriptions to publicize their Greekness and sacred history, while ‘religious institutions’ advertise their noble and ancient origins.

Motta’s intriguing investigation (‘Heroic Memory and polis. Achilles and Athens in Zosimus’ *Historia Nova*’) focuses on the accounts of Achilles and Athena as saviours of Athens from natural catastrophes and Alaric’s incursion in the 4th century AD, and raises questions of coherence of these reports with Eunapius’. Among many insightful points of this well-structured essay, the most interesting one for this reader were speculations on Neo-platonist contexts as frameworks for observance of pagan cults of divinities and heroes, and the author’s reflections concerning ancient providential interpretations of ominous events as reflexes of lived religious reality of the 4th century AD.

The second part of the book, thematically more coherent than the first, is introduced by a brief and clear preface written by Mastrocinque and Rüpke. The central point of the preface, as well as the second part of the volume, is to plead for more prominence for the concept of ‘religious experience,’ *jenseits* of mystery cults, and for recognition of individual responses to sacred architecture and sacred space in general as an important part of religious experience. In many ways, Rüpke’s paper is a *plaidoyer* and a *propemptic* – Rüpke focuses on emotional and philosophical responses to constructions of divine presence in Roman sanctuaries, and sketches the spectrum of emotionally loaded religious experiences which stretches from awe to *deisidaimonia* in consequence of epiphanic intimations: in many ways, the article reads as a complementary piece to H.S. Versnel’s famous ‘What did ancient man see when they saw a god,’ albeit with an explicit encouragement to students of Roman religion to adopt ‘experience’ and ‘emotion’ as hermeneutic tools.

This is precisely what Marlis Arnhold does (‘Group Settings and Religious Experience’): looking at cases of group experiences of cult practices, Arnhold focuses on what can we learn

about individual experiences of cult from the design of the sacred space and its transformations. She argues persuasively that one's experience of transcendence resulted from the awareness of self as a member of a group within a defined and ordered sacred space with a well-defined set of social attributes. Impact of the sacred space on one's sense of self is vividly discussed on the basis of a case of the Ostian association of *stuppatores* who at some point transformed their courtyard sanctuary into a *mithraeum* – transformation of the sacred space leads the author to offer interesting speculations on the range of experiences and emotional responses.

Attilio Mastrocinque's contribution ('Dionysos and Religious Experiences in Bona Dea Rituals') moves the focus from the sacred architecture to ritual, offers a series of observations on Dionysiac sarcophagi, and reads representations of the reliefs as reflections on contemporary Maenadic rituals of Fauna (daughter or wife of Faunus) / Bona Dea which should secure fertility of brides / brides to be.

Rituals represent focal point of Charles Guittard's concise contribution as well: 'From the *curia* on the Palatine to the *regia* on the *forum*: the itinerary as of the *salii* as a war ritual' sums up the gist well enough – after discussion of the ritual centres of *Salii*, the author considers religious topography and focuses on the armed procession which was organized twice a year, highlighting the initiatory character of the collegium and initiatory aspect of the ritual which he holds for unique (pp. 182-183).

Valentino Gasparini's paper ('Staging Religion. Cultic Performances in (and Around [*sic*] the Temple of Isis in Pompeii)'), the final of the volume and the most substantial in the second half of the book, investigates architectural and topographical features of the temple of Isis in Pompeii, in order to paint a vivid picture of the theatricality of the cultic goings-on: this is an elegant and inspired essay which combines analysis of architectural features with visual, epigraphic and literary sources to encourage the reader to experience some of the Isiac smells and sounds and to open their eyes for the visual texture of this cult at Pompeii.

The volume ends with a general, relatively well-organised index; however, there is no *index locorum*. In terms of book production, there is a fair number of typos and inconsistencies, especially when it comes to personal names and toponyms. Typos are mostly tolerable and of superficial nature, although it is somewhat annoying to find 'Sydima' more than once; occasional page with broken grammar, however, makes reading of certain stylistically ambitious and jargon-heavy passages a joyless experience.

This book, it is probably fair to say, is in its essence a volume of proceedings, which collectively does not amount to much more than the sum of its parts. But both parts have their merits – in both of them one will find food for thought and reasons to consider editors' challenges from the introduction and to decide whether to take them up or not – for those who do, this book might be a memorable (yet not religious) experience.

Andrej Petrovic

University of Durham

Werner Eck, *Judäa – Syria Palästina* (Texts and Studies in Ancient Judaism 157). Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2014. XIV + 307 Seiten. ISBN 978-3-16-1530265.

Das Schriftenverzeichnis von Werner Eck, des Kölner Emeritus für Alte Geschichte, umfasst 710 Titel. Es ist ein gewaltiges Werk der Gelehrsamkeit. Für die Erforschung von Judäa/Palästina ist es ein Glücksfall, dass sich Werner Eck früh und seit den späten 90er Jahren immer intensiver mit dieser Region auseinandergesetzt hat. Schon sein allererster Artikel befasste sich mit Masada und einer neuen Inschrift des L. Flavius Silva Nonius Bassus (*ZNTW* 60, 1969, 282-289). Eck, damals wissenschaftlicher Assistent am Institut für Altertumskunde an der Universität Köln, plädierte in diesem breit rezipierten Beitrag mit Hilfe des Neufunds für eine spätere Datierung des Falls von Masada (74 statt 73 n.Chr.). Auf Lucius Flavius Silva kommt Eck auch in einem Artikel zu sprechen, der im hier anzuzeigenden Band wiederabgedruckt ist: In „Lucius Flavius Silva, Bürger