SCRIPTA CLASSICA ISRAELICA

YEARBOOK OF THE ISRAEL SOCIETY
FOR THE PROMOTION OF CLASSICAL STUDIES

VOLUME XLIII **2024**

ISSN 0334–4509 (PRINT)
2731–2933 (ONLINE)

The appearance of this volume has been made possible by the support of

Bar-Ilan University
Ben-Gurion University of the Negev
The Hebrew University of Jerusalem
The Open University
Tel Aviv University
University of Haifa

PUBLISHED BY
THE ISRAEL SOCIETY FOR THE PROMOTION OF CLASSICAL STUDIES
http://www.israel-classics.org

Manuscripts in the form of e-mail attachments should be sent to the e-mail address rachelze@tauex.tau.ac.il. For reviews, contact yulia@bgu.ac.il. Please visit our website for submission guidelines. All submissions are refereed by outside readers.

Books for review should be sent to the Book Review Editor at the following address: Book Review Editor, Prof. Yulia Ustinova, Department of General History, Ben-Gurion University of the Negev, P.O.B. 653 Beer Sheva 8410501, Israel.

Price $50

Camera-ready copy produced by the editorial staff of *Scripta Classica Israelica*
Printed in Israel by Magnes Press, Jerusalem

SCRIPTA CLASSICA ISRAELICA

YEARBOOK OF THE ISRAEL SOCIETY
FOR THE
PROMOTION OF CLASSICAL STUDIES

VOLUME XLIII **2024**

CONTENTS

Bartolo Natoli, Angela Pitts, Judith P. Hallett. *Ancient Women Writers of Greece and Rome*. Routledge, Taylor & Francis Group, 2022. 424pp, 6 B/W Illustrations ISBN 9781003031727.

This volume is a sourcebook that aims to show students that there was more writing by women in the ancient world than they probably realize, and to enable them to read it. It should be successful in that goal. The format is: introduction to the volume; then an introduction to each author or group of authors, select bibliography, text, vocabulary list, commentary, translation, footnotes; then an appendix introducing Greek dialects, an appendix on meter, and a third appendix with Sappho's 'Brothers' and 'Kypris' poems (that is, recent poems that are included but whose dubious provenance is clearly marked), glossaries for Greek and Latin, and an index. There is some repetition, but this may be a feature, not a bug, because the authors know how sourcebooks are actually used, and this one is designed to be useful both in language classes at all levels past the most elementary and classes where all the reading is in translation. The effect of this attempt to be as accessible as possible is sometimes odd. The vocabularies for each poem, for example, give what the preface calls 'less familiar words,' but these include e.g. ἔρχομαι and *nemo*, and I am inclined to think that students who do not know such basic vocabulary should probably not be trying to read Sappho or Sulpicia. Less familiar words are sometimes omitted from these lists, though I did not identify any that were not in the final glossary. Similarly, the notes consistently identify even Doric ᾱ for Attic η.

The offerings are almost, but not quite all poetry, offering surviving poems and fragments of Sappho, Corinna, Erinna, Moero of Byzantium, Nossis, Anyte, Praxilla, and on the Roman side, Melinno (whom I would have put on the Greek side, especially if I inclined to the Hellenistic date the authors prefer), Sulpicia, Sulpicia Caleni (including Epigrammata Bobiensia 37), Claudia Severa (letters from Vindolanda), an anonymous Pompeian, Terentia, and the authors of graffiti from the Colossus of Memnon. I myself would not have included the letters of Claudia Severa, whose letters are not literary 'writing,' but students may enjoy this glimpse of women's friendship. Throughout, the authors emphasize the competence of ancient women to whom older scholarship was condescending, perhaps sometimes to excess, pointing to their use of allusion while ignoring weaknesses.

Hallett's introduction is lively and serves the purpose of heightening student interest while also making them feel like heirs and participants in the ongoing enterprise of recovering women's voices. Hallett, typically, points to pioneering women in the field, and stresses the sexism of the scholarly tradition, maybe even a bit more than necessary. While crude sexism originally led scholars to doubt Sulpicia's authorship even of the six core poems, some of the questions raised (not all) can still be valid questions and some of the recent arguments against authenticity are embedded in wider arguments and reward more complex thought. Neither the general introduction nor the section on Sulpicia cites Alison's Keith's 2006 'Critical Trends in Interpreting Sulpicia' (*Classical World* 100: 3–10). Hallett argues here, as she has elsewhere, that Sulpicia composed the Garland as well; I am not a good enough Latinist for my opinion to have any value, but it does not seem impossible. But the polemic is very helpful for teaching students to think about how the biases and social contexts of scholars influence how they interpret both literature and history. The section on Sulpicia and the commentary on individual poems are more cautious than the introduction, and this provides a balance that will further make students think. I do wish that the volume acknowledged the uncertainty about whether Sulpicia's father was the jurist or his son.

Teachers and students will be very happy to have all this material readily available, and there is an electronic version (which this reviewer used). The volume is rarely overdogmatic about

contentious issues. On both the Greek and Latin sides, there is a tendency to concentrate on the potentially metapoetic and mythological background and not to give much attention to realia. On Sulpicia 7, for example, the note explains that the Arab's fields smell good because they produce perfumes, but it does not say what these perfumes are, or where they the fields were, or how they were imported and what they signify ideologically; similarly with the Indian's gems, and not much about Tyrian purple. On Anyte 15, the notes tell about Aphrodite's birth from the sea, but not her actual role as a goddess for mariners, which is more directly relevant to the poem. Teachers will, of course, supplement the notes as their interests and those of their students direct, but the anthology has a very wide range, and when they venture out of the areas that they know best, potentially interesting and relevant questions may not even occur to them.

Meter is a weakness. Crasis is described as elision unless the printed text shows the crasis. The metrical section calls the meter of Corinna 654 'polyschematic' without explaining the term or adding 'choriambic dimeter.' It says that the first two dactyls of the pentameter in the elegiac couplet 'can resolve.' The praxilleion is described as 'three dactylic clausulae and a choriamb,' which makes no sense. A scazon is scanned as a trimeter. The section on Trebulla, under Colossus of Memnon, praises the merits of her poetry and does not comment on its metrical difficulties (to this reader she does not appear to have been a competent writer of trimeters). The introduction to dialects is not as well-attuned to student knowledge as most of the volume; it begins by listing the dialect groups as if they were the dialects themselves and does not explain the literary dialects as a background to the choices of the individual authors. Although digammas are mentioned and printed several times, the digamma is not explained. The bibliography for this section contains only two articles by Taylor Coughlin that address dialect as a stylistic feature in epigram.

The book has many small errors of various kinds. Mistakes are almost inevitable in a work like this, but they are a special problem in a textbook. I very much hope that there will be a second edition in which these can be corrected. When an article by Cazzato is cited as Cavatto, students may not find it in the relevant bibliography. Letters or words are omitted, or punctuation is incorrect, and while in most cases the text is easily emended, students might be confused. On Nossis, a reference to the '12-quatrain epigrams of Nossis' might lead them to imagine that she composed poems of 48 lines, not that there are 12 4-line poems. 'CIL 4.5296 can potentially give us a window into a portion of Roman society, which has hitherto been largely silenced'—this is a restrictive clause that should not be set off with a comma, since the author does not mean that Roman society has been largely silenced. Sometimes ideas are worded in such a way that their meaning is unclear. In the chapter on Erinna, for example, 'the assumption of a papyrological rendering' means 'printing a text that gives more information about the papyrus instead of one that is easier to read.' The student could easily think that there is scholarly disagreement about whether the papyrus published 1929 contains the poem by Erinna known as the *Distaff*, rather than about when the poem acquired that title. Sometimes the authors forget what students don't know—how is it helpful (in note 3 on Suplicia 1), to refer to the Porta Capena in explaining the Camenae? There are occasional mistakes in the languages; *compones* is not a present subjunctive. Anyte 16 is mistranslated—Zephyrus is not a source of summer discomfort, but provides a cooling breeze that is an attraction of the *locus amoenus*. There are also a few places where I am fairly confident that a claim is simply wrong. The pictured goat of Anyte 14 has not seduced a nymph; she has petted it. Memnon did not produce a sound 'each morning'—hearing Memnon was a sign of divine favor precisely because the sound was unpredictable. I do not see why the doves of Moero's hexameter fragment, honored by becoming the Pleiades, are identified with the 'doves' who were priestesses at Dodona, and a fuller

discussion of how this fragment fits with the various aetiologies of the constellation would show Moero's likely originality.

In short, I recommend the book, but urge instructors to use it with caution.

Ruth Scodel The University of Michigan and UC Davis
rscodel@umich.edu

David Wharton (ed.), *A Cultural History of Color in Antiquity*. The Cultural Histories Series. London: Bloomsbury Academic, 2022. Pp. 288. ISBN 9781474273275.

Le livre fait partie d'une série de 8 volumes collectifs éditée par Carole P. Biggam et Kirsten Wolf, qui vise à proposer des synthèses, par période chronologique, sur la place des couleurs dans les sociétés passées, dans une perspective culturelle croisant données matérielles, pratiques et représentations. David Wharton a dirigé le premier opus, consacré à l'Antiquité. Comme il l'explique dans l'introduction, le volume concerne essentiellement les mondes grecs et romain, couvrant une période allant du haut archaïsme en Grèce (début du Ier millénaire av. n. è.) à la fin de l'empire romain d'Occident – avec de rares incursions dans l'âge du bronze, essentiellement dans le dernier chapitre qui élargit en prenant en compte la Mésopotamie et l'Egypte. En dépit de cette focalisation sur les sociétés grecques et romaines, l'arc temporel et l'extension géographique restent larges, ce qui interdit bien sûr toute synthèse exhaustive : David Wharton a collecté, comme il le dit lui-même (p. 2), *a series of snapshots of ancient uses of color*. Le volume propose ainsi une vision kaléidoscopique de différents domaines liés aux pratiques de la couleur chez les Grecs et les Romains.

L'introduction offre au lecteur un panorama très utile et synthétique des recherches en cours et de l'état de nos connaissances sur le rôle des couleurs dans les sociétés anciennes, à partir des données philologiques et archéologiques. D. Wharton cite les travaux pionniers du britannique William Gladstone (1809–1898) sur Homère, car ils constituent un jalon important dans l'étude du lexique grec des couleurs : loin de les juger obsolètes, D. Wharton souligne la pertinence des intuitions du philologue quant à l'altérité des modes de perception des couleurs par les Grecs. Pour problématiser les questionnements et y associer les données matérielles, l'éditeur du volume prend l'exemple de la statue d'un archer qui ornait le fronton du temple d'Aphaia sur l'île d'Egine (début du Ve s. av. n. è.), pour laquelle l'archéologue Vinzenz Brinkmann et la peintre Ulrich Koch-Brinkmann ont proposé une reconstitution vivement colorée (on la trouvera dans le cahier couleurs rassemblé au milieu du volume). D. Wharton invite à aller au-delà de l'archéologie expérimentale : que voyaient les Grecs lorsqu'ils regardaient cette statue bariolée en levant les yeux vers le fronton du temple ? Qu'est-ce que ce type d'image en couleurs suscitait en eux ? Voilà assurément des questions stimulantes, qui situent clairement l'ouvrage dans le champ d'une histoire culturelle, des sensibilités, associée à une approche anthropologique et comparatiste, c'est-à-dire admettant la variabilité, selon les sociétés, des façons de penser, de sentir et d'agir des groupes humains.

Le plan du livre a dû se conformer à la grille type assignée à l'ensemble des volumes de la collection ; il comporte donc 10 chapitres, confiés à un ou une spécialiste du domaine concerné : Philosophie et science (K. Ierodiakonou) ; Technologie et commerce (H. Becker) ; Pouvoir et identité (K. Olson et D. Wharton) ; Religion et rituel (V. Platt) ; Corps et vêtement (Ll. Llewellyn-Jones) ; Langage et psychologie (K. Mc Donald) ; Littérature et arts performatifs (K. Bassi et D.